NATIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES PAKISTAN (PVT.) LIMITED

Disaster Management & Reconstruction Division



4154/334/MS/14.1/ 389

May 19, 2021

Hospital Director, Medical Teaching Institute Ayub Teaching Hospital, Abbottabad

Completion of left over works at First Floor of Ayub College of Dentistry at Medical Teaching Institute, Ayub Teaching Hospital, Abbottabad

Evaluation of Technical Bids

This has reference to Dy. Director Procurement ATH Abbottabad's Letter No. 1790-91/DD-P/ATH dated May 04, 2021 whereby 4 x Technical bid of subject works were forwarded for evaluation at our end.

Bid Evaluation Report along with 4 Nos. Bids in original are enclosed herewith for your review and further necessary action at your end.

Thanking you, For National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt.) Limited

(Muhammad Salman)
Project Manager

Encl: As above

Cc:

1. Dean / CEO MTI, ATH Abbottabad

2. Dy. Director Procurement MTI, ATH Abbottabad

3. GM / Head, DM&RD NESPAK

4. Office copy / Contracts Section



Website: www.nespak.com.pk, www.nespakerp.com

E-mail: info@nespakerp.com







AYUB TEACHING HOSPITAL, ABBOTTABAD



Completion of left over works at First Floor of Ayub College of Dentistry, Medical Teaching Institute, Ayub Teaching Hospital, Abbottabad

Technical Bid Evaluation Report May 2021

Clearance Code

4154/334/TBER/21(21)

Doc No.

4154-05

Rev No.

00



NATIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES PAKISTAN (PVT.) LIMITED

DISASTER MANAGEMENT & RECONSTRUCTION DIVISION (DM&RD)

NESPAK House, 3rd Floor, Sector G-5/2, Islamabad <u>Phone</u>: +(92-51) 2874018, 2874033, 2874021 Fax: (92-51) 2820144 <u>http:\\www.nespakerp.com</u>

Table of Contents

| 1. | INTRO | DUCTION | 1 |
|----|--------|--|---|
| | | | |
| | | ATION CRITERIA | |
| | 3.1 | Soundness And Access To Financial Resources: | |
| | 3.2 | Average Annual Construction Turnover | |
| | 3.3 | General Construction Experience | |
| | 3.4 | Contracts of Similar Size and Nature | |
| | 3.5 | Personnel | 3 |
| | 3.6 | Data regarding past performance and present commitment of the Bidder | 4 |
| | 3.7 | Passing Criteria | |
| 4. | SUMM | ARY OF EVALUATION | 5 |
| 5. | RESULT | T / CONCLUSION | 6 |
| | | TISMENT | |
| 7. | DETAIL | ED EVALUATION SHEETS | E |



1. INTRODUCTION

Ayub Teaching Hospital (ATH) is public sector, non-profit tertiary level academic health sciences center located in Abbottabad. It is serving northeastern district of Khyber Pakhtukhwa(KP) and North eastern District of Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJ&K). Hospital also serves as teaching hospital of Ayub Medical College.

2. BRIEF

ATH received funding from Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa for completion of left over works at Dentistry Block. It was earlier designed by M/s Meridian International which comprised of Basement and three floors. However, the work could not be completed. As of today, structure work of Basement, Ground and First Floor is completed with partial completion of finishing works. However, Dowels are provided for construction of second floor.

Project under discussion comprises of completion of Civil, Electrical, Plumbing of first floor and External Development Works of First Floor of Ayub College of Dentistry at Medical Teaching Institute, Ayub Teaching Hospital, Abbottabad. Following execution and completion of above stated Work, the Contractor shall be obliged to remedy defects therein in accordance with the provisions of Contract.

Single Stage Two Envelope procedure was adopted for the said works. Bidding was open only to Firms/Constructors Duly licensed by the Pakistan Engineering Council from Category CA to C4 and specialization relevant (PEC Code CE-10 & EE-04) to the type of work. Notice Inviting Tender was published in national newspapers with the closing date of May 04, 2021 at 1100 Hours for submission of Technical and Financial Bids (attached as Annexure-A).

In response to the advertisement published in newspaper, following 5 X Firms/Constructors participated in the Bidding Process. These are;

- 1. M/s Ahmadullah & Co.
- 2. M/s Badi-uz-zaman & Co.
- 3. M/s Qasim Zaman
- 4. M/s Abbasi & Sons
- M/s United Construction

Bid of M/s United Construction was rejected by the Purchase Committee of the Employer as the Constructor submitted the Financial Bid Only. Deputy Director Procurement ATH forwarded the Technical Bids of remaining 4 X Constructors vide letter no. 1790-91/DD-P/ATH dated May 04, 2021.

NESPAK carried out the evaluation of Technical Bids of 4 X Firms/Constructors on the basis of their documents in accordance with the Bid Evaluation Criteria. The criterion was duly included in the Bidding Documents already issued to the Firms/Constructors.





3. EVALUATION CRITERIA

The detailed evaluation was carried out on the basis of the Pass / Fail criteria for the different categories given hereunder:

- Soundness & Access to Financial Resources
- Average Annual Construction Turnover
- General Construction Experience
- Contracts of Similar Size and Nature
- Personnel
- Data regarding past performance and present commitment of the Bidders

The detailed criteria for each category were followed as given under each head as follows:

3.1 Soundness and Access to Financial Resources:

"The Bidder must demonstrate access to, or availability of, financial resources such as liquid assets, unencumbered real assets, lines of credits, and other financial means, other than any contractual advance payments, to meet the financial requirements of the contract in the amount of his bid. As a minimum the Bidder must show that his resources, in term of at least his latest year's working capital and line of credits, will be adequate to cover an amount equivalent to his bid price and current work commitments i.e.

[5 x working capital + Project specific lines of credit– 40% of current contract commitments] \geq Bid price.

Working capital is the difference between current assets and current liabilities and measures the firm's ability to generate cash in the short term."

3.2 Average Annual Construction Turnover

| Criteria | Bidders' to list their certified yearly turnover for last 3 years | | | |
|--|---|--|--|--|
| Minimum average annual construction turnover of Pak Rupees 40 Million Calculated as total certified payments received for contracts in progress or completed, within the last 3 years. | | | | |



3.3 General Construction Experience

| Requirement | Bidder to Provide details | Role | |
|--|---------------------------|------|--|
| Experience under construction contracts in the role of contractor, subcontractor, or management contractor for at least the last 5 years prior to the bid submission deadline. | | | |

3.4 Contracts of Similar Size and Nature

| Requirement | Bidder to provide specific details | Role |
|---|------------------------------------|------|
| Participation as contractor, management contractor, or subcontractor, in at least 2 Contracts within the last 5 years, each with a value of at least Rs 80 Million that has been successfully or is substantially completed / currently in hand and that are similar to the proposed works. The similarity shall be based on the physical size, complexity, methods, technology or other characteristics as indicated in these Bidding Documents. | | |

3.5 Personnel

The Bidder must demonstrate that it has the personnel for the key positions that meet the following requirements:

| Sr. No. | Position | Total No. in the Firm | Minimum requirement for the Project | Total Work Experience [years] | Nos. already posted on other projects | Nos. being allocated for this project | Professional credits points |
|------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | B-Sc. Civil Engineering | | 1 | | | | |
| 2 | B-Sc. Electrical Engineering | | 1 | | | 4 | |



3.6 Data regarding past performance and present commitment of the Bidder

| | Name of ongoing project(s) | | Date of | | Progress | | | Satisfactory performance |
|------------|----------------------------|---------------------|---------|------------|-----------------|----------------------|---|---|
| Sr. No. | | Name of Employer | Start | Completion | %Age as planned | %Age at actual | Remarks regarding delays if applicable | certificate from employer (Minimum requirement) |
| 1. | | | | | | | | |
| 2. | | | | | | | | |
| 3. | | | | | | | | |
| 4. | | | | | 11, | | | |
| 5. | | | | | | | | |

Number of projects that a bidder can undertake to construct as per PEC works bylaws is aggregate Professional Credit Points (PCPs) authorized for a category of licensee divided by the PCP of construction and capital cost of single project under consideration.

3.7 Passing Criteria

Applicants meeting the minimum requirements mentioned above besides other factors considered for technical qualification. Applicant's Financial Capabilities, Personnel Capabilities, Equipment Capabilities and relevant Experiences given due importance while making assessment and any major deviation in this regard, materially affecting the minimum qualifying criteria and non-provision of supporting documents/evidences are resulted in disqualification of the subject applicant.



4. SUMMARY OF EVALUATION

Summary of Evaluation is given hereunder

| | | Bid Evaluation | | | | | | |
|------------|------------------------------|--|--------------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------------------------|-----------|---|---------------------|
| Sr. No. | Name of Firm | Soundness and Access to Financial Resources | Construction Turnover | General Construction Experience | Contracts of Similar Size & Nature | Personnel | Past Projects & Current Commitments | Final Evaluation |
| 1 | M/s Ahmadullah Khan & Co. | Fail | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Fail |
| 2 | M/s Badi-uz-Zaman & Co. | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass |
| 3 | M/s Qasim Zaman | Fail | Fail | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Fail |
| 4 | M/s Abbasi & Sons | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass |







5. RESULT / CONCLUSION

It is found that following 2 X Firms/Constructors has been technically qualified according to the given criteria.

| | | Bid Evaluation | | | | | | |
|------------|-------------------------|--|--------------------------|---------------------------------------|--|-----------|---|---------------------|
| Sr. No. | Name of Firm | Soundness and Access to Financial Resources | Construction Turnover | General Construction Experience | Contracts of Similar Size & Nature | Personnel | Past Projects & Current Commitments | Final Evaluation |
| 1 | M/s Badi-uz-Zaman & Co. | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass |
| 2 | M/s Abbasi & Sons | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass | Pass |

The detailed evaluation of all the Firms/Constructors is attached for reference. The Employer may verify at his own end, the documents submitted by Firms/Constructors in their Technical Bid. The foregoing notwithstanding, the above recommendations are based upon the documents provided to this office.





6. ADVERTISMENT

MEDICAL TEACHING INSTITUTION, AYUB TEACHING HOSPITAL ABBOTTABAD

NOTICE INVITING TENDER

- 1. Bids are invited from the Constructors registered with Pakistan Engineering Council (P.E.C) in Category CA to C4 with specialization in relevant PEC Code (CE-10, EE-04,) for Completion of left over works at First Floor of Ayub College of Dentistry at Medical Teaching Institute, Ayub Teaching Hospital, Abbottabad, Notice Inviting Tender is also available on Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Public Procurement Regulatory Authority website and Institutional official website www.ath.gov.pk.
- 2. The Bidding documents can be obtained from office of Hospital Director, Medical Teaching Institution, Ayub Teaching Hospital Abbottabad during working office hours on submission of a written application and upon payment of a non-refundable cost of Bid Document amounting to Rs. 2,000/- in the form of Bank Draft/Pay order in favour of Hospital Director Medical Teaching Institution, Ayub Teaching Hospital Abbottabad or on cash payment Rs. 2000/- in account branch of Ayub Teaching Hospital.
- The percentage of BID SECURITY shall be 2% of the engineer estimate, in the form of Call Deposit, in favour of Hospital Director, Medical Teaching Institution, Ayub Teaching Hospital Abbottabad.
- Sealed Bids should reach the office of Hospital Director, Medical Teaching Institution, Ayub Teaching Hospital Abbottabad till 11: 00 hours on or before 04-05-2021 at the address, Hospital Director, Medical Teaching Institution, Ayub Teaching Hospital Abbottabad.
- Bids will be opened at 11: 30 hours on dated <u>04-05-2021</u> in the presence of the Bidders or their authorized representatives who choose to attend.
- The pre bid meeting will be held on 23-04-2021 at 10:30 hours in the conference room of Hospital Director Ayub Teaching Hospital Abbottabad.
- 7. The bidding procedure will be Single Stage-Two Envelopes
- "Instructions to Bidders" must be read carefully and followed by the Bidder as mentioned in Volume-I of the Bidding Documents.
- 9. Conditional, incomplete and bid filled with lead pencil/pen are not acceptable.
- The Bidder must submit one original and one (01) true photo copy of the Bidding documents.
- 11. Any Bid not accompanied by an acceptable Bid Security in form of call deposit, shall be rejected by the Employer being Non Responsive.
- 12. In case of bid/rate quoted by the bidder more than 10% below engineer estimate, the additional bid security in form of call deposit shall be sought from the successful bidder only to the extent of bid more than 10% below the engineer estimate in the form of percentage. The amount of additional bid security in form of call deposit shall be equal to the impact of financial difference occurring in the quoted rates beyond 10% below engineer estimate. Failure for provision of same will result in rejection of Bids.
- The Procuring Entity may reject all bids or proposals as per rule 47(1) of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Public Procurement Authority Rules 2014.
- 14. The firms must be registered with Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Revenue Authority.

Hospital Director
Medical Teaching Institution,
Ayub Teaching Hospital Abbottabad
(Ph: 0992-9311155, Fax 0992-931154)



7. DETAILED EVALUATION SHEETS

Name of Constructor:

M/s Ahmadullah Khan & Co.

General Information

| CITCI | ar injormation | |
|-------|--------------------------------------|--|
| 1 | Head Office Address | 71, Shami Road Near Defence Colony Peshawar |
| 2 | Contact Person | Khan Wajid Ali Khan |
| 3 | Telephone | 0348-9648580, 0300-9362041 |
| 4 | Fax | N/A |
| 5 | Email | khanwajidalikhan777@gmail.com |
| 6 | Place of Incorporation/ Registration | Khyber Pakhtunkhwa |
| 7 | Year of Incorporation/ Registration | 1,985 |
| 8 | PEC Registration No. | C3-3571 |
| 9 | Validity | 30-Jun-21 |
| 10 | PEC Code for Specialization | EE-05, <u>CE-10</u> , EE-06, CE-09, EE-01, EE-11(i), EE-02 <u>EE-04</u> , CE-04(v), CE-01 |
| 11 | KPRA Registration | K3108511-3 |
| 12 | NTN # | 3108511-3 |
| | | |

Soundness and Access to Financial Resources

| S. No. | Description | Bid Price (Estimated Price) Million Rs. | Financial Resources (as per given formula) | Status |
|--------|--|---|---|--------|
| 1 | Soundness and Access to Financial Resources | 80 | Current Financial Status (Audit Reports / Tax Returns) not provided by Bidder | Fail |



Average Annual Construction Turnover

Evaluated from Form B-N1

| S. No. Description | | Min. Turnover required (Million Rs) | Turnover of Constructor (Million Rs.) | Status |
|--------------------|-------------------------|---|---|--------|
| 1 | Average Annual turnover | 40 | 45 | Pass |

General Experience

Evaluated from Form B-O1

| S. No. | Description | Working as Contractor From | Status | |
|--------|---|-------------------------------|--------|--|
| 1 | Experience as Contractor for Last 5 Years | 2002 | Pass | |

Contracts of Similar Size and Nature

Evaluated from Form B-O1

| S. No. | Description | No. of Projects | Status |
|--------|--|-----------------|--------|
| 1 | Completed / in hand at least 2 Projects in last 5 Years of cost more than Rs. 80 Million of Similar Nature | 2 | Pass |

Personnel

Evaluated from Form B-O2

| Sr. No. | Position | Total No. in the Firm | Minimum Required | Status |
|---------|------------------------------|--------------------------|------------------|--------|
| 1 | B.Sc Civil Engineering | 1 | 1 | Door |
| 2 | B, Sc Electrical Engineering | 3 | 1 | Pass |

Past Projects & Current Commitments

| PEC Category | C3 |
|---|------|
| Maximum No. of Projects over 80 Million in hand Allowed | 14 |
| Projects over 80 Million currently in hand | 0 |
| Status | Pass |





Completion of Left Over Works at First Floor of Ayub College of Dentistry, Medical Teaching Institute, Ayub Medical College, Abbottabad

Name of Constructor:

M/s Badi-uz-Zaman & Co.

General Information

| 1 | Head Office Address | Flat # 19 Cantonment Plaza, 2nd Floor Cantonment Bazaar, Abbottabad |
|----|--------------------------------------|--|
| 2 | Contact Person | Irfan Majeed |
| 3 | Telephone | 0992-332621 |
| 4 | Fax | 0992-332077 |
| 5 | Email | BZK 786@yahoo.com |
| 6 | Place of Incorporation/ Registration | Peshawar |
| 7 | Year of Incorporation/ Registration | 1984 |
| 8 | PEC Registration No. | C1-993 |
| 9 | Validity | 30-Jun-21 |
| 10 | PEC Code for Specialization | BC-01, BC-02, CE-01, CE-02, CE-04, CE-09, <u>CE-10</u> , EE-01, EE-02, EE-03, <u>EE-04</u> , EE-06, EE-11, ME-01, ME-02, ME-04, ME-06, ME-07 |
| 11 | KPRA Registration | K0660571-7 |
| 12 | NTN# | 0660571-7 |

Soundness and Access to Financial Resources

| S. No. | Description | Bid Price (Estimated Price) Million Rs. | Financial Resources (as per given formula) Million Rs. | Status |
|--------|---|---|---|--------|
| 1 | Soundness and Access to Financial Resources | 80 | 2181 | Pass |





Completion of Left Over Works at First Floor of Ayub College of Dentistry, Medical Teaching Institute, Ayub Medical College, Abbottabad

Average Annual Construction Turnover

Evaluated from Form B-N1

| S. No. | Description | Min. Turnover required (Million Rs) | Turnover of Constructor (Million Rs.) | Status |
|--------|-------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|--------|
| 1 | Average Annual turnover | 40 | 362 | Pass |

General Experience

Evaluated from Form B-O1

| S. No. | Description | Working as Contractor From | Status |
|--------|---|----------------------------------|--------|
| 1 | Experience as Contractor for Last 5 Years | 1994 | Pass |

Contracts of Similar Size and Nature

Evaluated from Form B-O1

| S. No. | Description | No. of Projects | Status |
|--------|--|-----------------|--------|
| 1 | Completed / in hand at least 2 Projects in last 5 Years of cost more than Rs. 80 Million of Similar Nature | 2 | Pass |

Personnel

Evaluated from Form B-O2

| Sr. No. | Position | Total No. in the Firm | Minimum Required | Status |
|------------|------------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------|--------|
| 1 | B. Sc Civil Engineering | 1 | 1 | |
| 2 | B. Sc Electrical Engineering | 2 | 1 | Pass |

Financial Soundness

| PEC Category | C-1 |
|---|------|
| Maximum No. of Projects over 80 Million in hand Allowed | 64 |
| Projects over 80 Million currently in hand | 1 |
| Status | Pass |





Name of Constructor:

M/s Qasim Zaman

General Information

| 1 | Head Office Address | Flat # 19 Cantonment Plaza, 2nd Floor Cantonment Bazzar, Abbottabad | |
|----|---|--|--|
| 2 | Contact Person | Qasim Zaman | |
| 3 | Telephone | 0992-332621 | |
| 4 | Fax | 0992-332077 | |
| 5 | Email | gasimzaman47@gmail.com | |
| 6 | Place of Incorporation/ Registration | N/A | |
| 7 | Year of Incorporation/ Registration | N/A | |
| 8 | PEC Registration No. | C4-11323 | |
| 9 | Validity | June 30, 2021 | |
| 10 | PEC Code for Specialization | CE01, EE06, CE09, CE04(v), EE01, <u>EE04</u> , EE11(i), <u>CE10</u> | |
| 11 | KPRA Registration | K4337851-0 | |
| 12 | NTN# | 4337851-0 | |

Soundness and Access to Financial Resources

| S. No. | Description | Bid Price (Estimated Price Million Rs. | Financial Resources (as per given formula) Million Rs. | Status |
|--------|--|--|---|--------|
| 1 | Soundness and Access to Financial Resources | 80 | 45 | Fail |





Average Annual Construction Turnover

Evaluated from Form B-N1

| S. No. | Description | Min. Turnover required Million Rs. | Turnover of Constructor Million Rs. | Status |
|--------|-------------------------|--|---|--------|
| 1 | Average Annual turnover | 40 | 34 | Fail |

General Experience

Evaluated from Form B-O1

| S. No. | Description | Working as Contractor From | Status |
|--------|---|-------------------------------|--------|
| 1 | Experience as Contractor for Last 5 Years | 2011 | Pass |

Contracts of Similar Size and Nature

Evaluated from Form B-O1

| S. No. | Description | No. of Projects | Status |
|--------|--|-----------------|--------|
| 1 | Completed / in hand at least 2 Projects in last 5 Years of cost more than Rs. 80 Million of Similar Nature | 2 | Pass |

Personnel

Evaluated from Form B-O2

| Sr. No. | Position | Total No. in the Firm | Minimum Required | Status |
|------------|------------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------|--------|
| 1 | B. Sc Civil Engineering | 1 | 1 | Door |
| 2 | B. Sc Electrical Engineering | 1 | 1 | Pass |

Financial Soundness

| PEC Category | C4 |
|---|------|
| Maximum No. of Projects over 80 Million in hand Allowed | 11 |
| Projects over 80 Million currently in hand | 1 |
| Status | Pass |





Name of Constructor:

M/s M. Abbasi & Sons

General Information

| 1 | Head Office Address | Tayyab Erdogan Plaza Flat No. 3 Abbottabad | |
|----|---|--|--|
| 2 | Contact Person | Abid Abbasi | |
| 3 | Telephone | 0992-333314 | |
| 4 | Fax | 0992-335667 | |
| 5 | Email | mabbasiandsons@gmail.com | |
| 6 | Place of Incorporation/ Registration | KP | |
| 7 | Year of Incorporation/ Registration | N/A | |
| 8 | PEC Registration No. | 2547 | |
| 9 | Validity | June 30, 2021 | |
| 10 | PEC Code for Specialization | EE01, EE02, CE01, <u>CE10,</u> EE11(vi), EE07, EE11(i), CE04(ii), <u>EE04,</u> CE09 | |
| 11 | KPRA Registration | K4302220-7 | |
| 12 | NTN# | 4302220-7 | |

Soundness and Access to Financial Resources

| S. No. | Description | Bid Price (Estimated Price) Million Rs. | Financial Resources (as per given formula) Million Rs. | Status |
|-----------|---|---|--|--------|
| 1 | Soundness and Access to Financial Resources | 80 | 458 | Pass |





Average Annual Construction Turnover

Evaluated from Form B-N1

| S. No. | Description | Min. Turnover required Million Rs | Turnover of Constructor Million Rs. | Status |
|-----------|-------------------------|---|---|--------|
| 1 | Average Annual turnover | 40 | 253 | Pass |

General Experience

Evaluated from Form B-O1

| S. No. | Description | Working as Contractor From | Status |
|-----------|---|-------------------------------|--------|
| 1 | Experience as Contractor for Last 5 Years | 2008 | Pass |

Contracts of Similar Size and Nature

Evaluated from Form B-O1

| S. No. | Description | No. of Projects | Status |
|-----------|--|-----------------|--------|
| 1 | Completed / in hand at least 2 Projects in last 5 Years of cost more than Rs. 80 Million of Similar Nature | 2 | Pass |

Personnel

Evaluated from Form B-O2

| Sr. No. | Position | Total No. in the Firm | Minimum Required | Status |
|------------|------------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------|--------|
| 1 | B. Sc Civil Engineering | 1 | 1 | Dana |
| 2 | B. Sc Electrical Engineering | 1 | 1 | Pass |

Financial Soundness

Evaluated from Form B-O3

| PEC Category | C2 |
|---|------|
| Maximum No. of Projects over 80 Million in hand Allowed | 25 |
| Projects over 80 Million currently in hand | 2 |
| Status | Pass |



Annexure | B